MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF THE CULTURAL HERITAGE COMMISSION CITY OF SOUTH PASADENA, CALIFORNIA CONVENED THIS 21ST DAY OF AUGUST, 2014 COUNCIL CHAMBERS, 1424 MISSION STREET

ROLL CALL		The Meeting convened at:	6:50 PM
		Commissioners Present:	John Lesak (Chair), James McLane (Vice- Chair), West J. De Young, Deborah Howell- Ardila
		Commissioners Absent:	Robert Conte
		Council Liaison Absent:	Michael A. Cacciotti, Councilmember
	_	Staff Liaison Present:	John Mayer, Senior Planner
NON-AGENDA PUBLIC COMMENT PERIOD	1.	None.	
PRESENTATION	2	Debby Figori (City Senior Management Analyst) gave a PowerPoint	

PRESENTATION

2. Debby Figoni (City Senior Management Analyst) gave a PowerPoint presentation about the pros and cons of using synthetic turf in the front yards. She is soliciting policy recommendations for the City Council's consideration. She responded to questions about synthetic turf in terms of permeability and fading.

Public Comment:

Kate Finley (Natural Resources and Environmental Commission) said that she wants the City Council to allow synthetic turf within the City's parkways.

Odom Stamps spoke in opposition to the use of synthetic turf because of several problems including the loss of microbes and its fake appearance around historic homes.

Al Benzoni (Natural Resources and Environmental Commission) argued that the synthetic turf has much less lead than it used to have and that it is very low maintenance.

Discussion:

Commissioners raised several concerns about the use of synthetic turf. It adds to the urban heat island effect. One commissioner made reference to the high school's artificial grass and how hot it can get. There are concerns about the material ending up in the landfill and the "hidden cost" associated with that. The material shifts the character of a historic neighborhood in an inappropriate way. There are more natural alternatives to green lawns that are attractive and use less water. The artificial material conflicts with the "natural surroundings" concept of the Craftsman style architecture in South Pasadena. There are also concerns about the appearance of synthetic turf several years into the future.

CONTINUED APPLICATIONS

3. None.

NEW ITEMS

4. 2033 Primrose Avenue

Applicant: Kyle Moto, Designer Project number: 1737-COA/DRX

Historic Status Code: 5D3

Project Description:

A request for Certificate of Appropriateness for a498 sq. ft. single story addition towards the rear of an existing 1,520 sq. ft. single story Colonial Revival style house located on a 7,500 sq. ft. lot. The existing 335 sq. ft. single vehicle detached garage is being proposed to be demolished and a new 495 sq. ft. detached two vehicle garage is being proposed on the rear of the property. The single story addition will consist of a master bedroom with a walk-in closet, a master bathroom, and a laundry room. The proposed materials will consist of; fiberglass windows for the addition, wood siding matching the existing, and composition shingle roof materials, matching the existing roof.

Presentation:

Kyle Moto (designer) presented his project. He responded to questions about the exterior material of the detached garage, the variety of window types, and the floor plan with respect to the number of bedrooms in the home.

Ivan Chu (structural engineer) presented his findings about the demolition of the detached garage. He responded to questions about actions that were necessary to prevent, or mitigate the perceived emergency.

Public Comment:

None.

Discussion:

Commissioner McLane noted that the garage can be re-created in a new location with a shed to the side of it. The applicant can use the new two foot setback allowance for the detached garage. Commissioner Howell-Ardila said that a patio may have been filled in; the addition is pushed back and is sensitive throughout. Commissioner Lesak had concerns about all the different window types. Commissioners discussed neighborhood character and allowing the owner to have a functional garage.

Commission Decision:

Motion/Second (Lesak/McLane) to **APPROVE** the project with the following **CONDITIONS:** the applicant shall obtain a Chair Review for the following two items: 1) investigate the window patterns for the addition and make them all consistent; and 2) the applicant shall re-examine the garage, reviewing the new setback ordinance for detached garages and to keep the street facing elevation the same as the original garage structure and to design a shed to achieve the second covered space.

This motion was made on the finding that the project is appropriate to the design, size, and massing of the historic residence and the design context of the historic neighborhood.

The motion carried 4-0, Conte Absent.

Upon consideration of the criteria identified in Section 2.64(b)(2) of the South Pasadena Municipal Code, consideration of the application, and all written and oral testimony submitted, including the evaluation of the property by a qualified architectural historian and categorization of the property as set forth in the City's Cultural Heritage Inventory, the Cultural Heritage Commission found and determined that 2033 Primrose Avenue as it exists, and as it is proposed to be altered, would reasonably meet national, state or local criteria for designation as a landmark or part of an historic district, and is exempt from CEQA under Class 31.

5. 1024 B Mission Street

Applicant: Boris Shirvanian Project number: 1710-COA/DRX

Historic Status Code: 1D

Project Description:

A request for Certificate of Appropriateness for proposed blade sign. The blade sign will be 18"x16". The sign will read, "OCULUS OPTOMETRY". The sign font will be red. The proposed blade material will be aluminum. The color will be a gray to match the existing building color.

Presentation:

Ben Conway (Paradise Signs) presented his project and responded to questions about the sign's height and whether it can be lowered.

Public Comment:

None.

Commission Decision:

Motion/Second (McLane/Lesak) to **APPROVE** the project with the following **CONDITION:** the applicant shall submit the following items for Chair Review approval: 1) lower the mounting height so that it's approximately centered in the frieze above the store window; and 2) use a solid plate for the main field of the sign instead of a box.

The motion was made on the finding that the project is appropriate to the design, size, and massing of the historic building and the design context of the historic neighborhood. The sign is compatible with the historic building. The project nicely enhances the appearance of the building without obliterating its original design, character, or heritage.

The motion carried 4-0, Conte Absent.

Upon consideration of the criteria identified in Section 2.64(b)(2) of the

South Pasadena Municipal Code, consideration of the application, and all written and oral testimony submitted, including the evaluation of the property by a qualified architectural historian and categorization of the property as set forth in the City's Cultural Heritage Inventory, the Cultural Heritage Commission found and determined that 1024 Mission Street as it exists, and as it is proposed to be altered, would reasonably meet national, state or local criteria for designation as a landmark or part of an historic district, and is exempt from CEQA under Class 31.

6. 632 Milan Avenue

Applicant: Odom Stamps, Designer Project number: 1720-COA/DRX

Historic Status Code: 5D1

Project Description:

A request for Certificate of Appropriateness for a 371 sq. ft. single story addition towards the rear of an existing 1,494 sq. ft. single story Craftsman style house located on a 10,056 sq. ft. lot. A new 452 sq. ft. detached two vehicle garage is being proposed on the rear of the property. The single story addition will consist of a master bedroom, a master bathroom, and expanding the existing laundry room. The proposed materials will consist of; wood windows for the addition, painted clapboard wood siding, and asphalt shingle roof materials, matching the existing roof.

Presentation:

Odom Stamps (project designer) presented his project and responded to questions about the home's siding.

Public Comment:

None.

Commission Decision:

Motion/Second (Lesak/Howell-Ardila) to **APPROVE** the project with the following **CONDITION:** In concert with the investigation of the original siding underneath the asbestos shingles, investigate a way of creating a plainer differentiation between the new addition and the existing residence on the home's north elevation.

This motion was made on the finding that the project is appropriate to the design, size, and massing of the historic residence and the design context of the historic neighborhood. And, the project nicely enhances the appearance of the residence without obliterating its original design, character, or heritage.

The motion carried 4-0, Conte Absent.

Upon consideration of the criteria identified in Section 2.64(b)(2) of the South Pasadena Municipal Code, consideration of the application, and all written and oral testimony submitted, including the evaluation of the property by a qualified architectural historian and categorization of the

property as set forth in the City's Cultural Heritage Inventory, the Cultural Heritage Commission found and determined that 632 Milan Avenue as it exists, and as it is proposed to be altered, would reasonably meet national, state or local criteria for designation as a landmark or part of an historic district, and is exempt from CEQA under Class 31.

7. 1001 Mission Street

Applicant: Tom Nott, Architect Project number: 1734-COA/DRX

Historic Status Code: 1

Project Description:

A request for Certificate of Appropriateness to add a new aluminum clad window to rear unit located on the rear of the Alexander Building. The existing structure is a Historic Landmark.

Presentation:

Tom Nott (project architect) presented his project and responded to questions about the building's structural details and the use of unit.

Public Comment:

None.

Commission Discussion:

Commissioners discussed their concerns about conjecture with the proposed cornice. There was some discussion about the sill and the use of foam on this building. Commissioners agreed that the window should have a simpler design.

Commission Decision:

Motion/Second Lesak/Howell-Ardila) to **APPROVE** the project with the following **CONDITION:** the applicant shall submit the following items for Chair Review approval: the window sill and cornice material shall not be made of a foam material and the applicant shall simplify their design.

This motion was made on the finding that the structure to be modified is a later period addition to a historic building. This new building addition is more clearly distinguished from the original period construction. The proposed window will have a more simplified design with a more durable material that's sensitive to the block material.

The motion carried 4-0, Conte Absent.

Upon consideration of the criteria identified in Section 2.64(b)(2) of the South Pasadena Municipal Code, consideration of the application, and all written and oral testimony submitted, including the evaluation of the property by a qualified architectural historian and categorization of the property as set forth in the City's Cultural Heritage Inventory, the Cultural Heritage Commission found and determined that 1001 Mission Street as it exists, and as it is proposed to be altered, would reasonably meet national,

state or local criteria for designation as a landmark or part of an historic district, and is exempt from CEQA under Class 31.

Chair Lesak re-opened the public hearing and allowed Mr. Nott to speak. Mr. Nott said that he will remove the cornice and sill features for a simpler design.

Chair Lesak acknowledged that statement and confirmed that the change would still require a Chair review.

NEW BUSINESS

8. Historic Context Statement

Staff informed the Commission that the review of the City-Wide Historic Context Statement (HCS) will need to be continued to the September 18, 2014 meeting. The consultant preparing the document had a computer glitch that deleted portions of the draft.

9. 1130 Mission Street Conceptual Review

Historic Status Code: 5S1

Presentation:

A conceptual review for a new 7 sq. ft. sign with dimensions of 10"inch x 8'6"ft. The new sign will be a brushed aluminum case with reverse channel letter and halo backlit for "Oculus Optometry". The proposed sign is a facia band sign facing Mission Street. The proposed material will be brushed aluminum.

Discussion:

Commissioners were generally in favor of the proposed awning. They requested to see a sample of the metal to check its quality when it returns for a Certificate of Appropriateness.

10. 307 Fremont Avenue

Applicant: Erick Molinar

Conceptual Review

Historic Status Code: 4X

Commissioner Lesak introduced this item with a brief history based on his discussions with the prospective applicant. He explained how the house has changed over time.

Presentation:

Erick Molinar solicited comments from the Commission regarding a proposal for a 931 sq. ft. single story addition and a 307 sq. ft. second story addition to an existing 2,073 sq. ft. two story English Revival house. A new 400 sq. ft. two vehicle garage attached to an 850 sq. ft. guest house. A 200 sq. ft. carport is also being proposed.

Discussion:

Commissioner McLane had concerns about changes to the front of the house. The second floor space may need to be rearranged. Commissioners provided some comments about minor changes that can be made and there was a request for some more drawing details. The Commission took no action on the proposed project.

11. 230 HillsideRd

Conceptual Review

Historic Status Code: 2D2

Presentation:

Ron Ettinger solicited comments from the Commission regarding a proposal for a two story addition to the side of the existing Spanish Revival style house.

Discussion:

Commissioners preferred that the addition have the same pitch as the existing roof line.

COMMUNICATIONS

12. Comments from Council Liaison

None

13. Comments from Commission

Commissioner Lesak said that the applicants need to circle the picture of the windows they want in the brochures that Commissioners review. He also said that the owner of the Fleet House is having some challenges with the home's remodel. Commissioner Lesak asked that the Historic Context Statement and Ordinance be placed on next month's agenda.

Commissioner McLane spoke about a chair review for a window replacement project at the Smith and Williams building.

14. Comments from South Pasadena Preservation Foundation Liaison

None

15. Comments from Staff

Staff announced that the South Pasadena Unified School District and developer will have an open house workshop to introduce the project on Wednesday, September 10, 2014 at 6:30 PM in the School Board room.

MINUTES

16. Minutes of the regular meeting of January 16, 2014

The Commission did not vote on the minutes; they were not included in the agenda packet.

17. Minutes of the regular meeting of February 20, 2014

The Commission did not vote on the minutes; they were not included in the agenda packet.

	18. Minutes of the regular meeting of March 20, 2014
	The Commission did not vote on the minutes; they were not included in the agenda packet.
	19. Minutes of the regular meeting of April 17, 2014
	The Commission did not vote on the minutes; they were not included in the agenda packet.
	20. Minutes of the regular meeting of June 19, 2014
	The Commission did not vote on the minutes; they were not included in the agenda packet.
	21. Minutes of the regular meeting of July 17, 2014
	The Commission did not vote on the minutes; they were not included in the agenda packet.
ADJOURNMENT	22. Meeting Adjourned at 10:00 p.m. to the regularly scheduled meeting of September 18, 2014.
John Losak, Chair	10 · 21 · 2014 Date